Tertullian and Roman Law – What Do We (Not) Know?

Ian L.S. BALFOUR, Edinburgh, UK

ABSTRACT

Whether Tertullian had expertise in Roman law before his conversion to Christianity, or whether his knowledge of it was non-specialist, through studying rhetoric as part of his education, has been debated in more than two dozen scholarly works since 1735. This article doesn't comment on that but asks, for the first time as far as I know, how far these studies recognize that we have almost no legal writings in the form in which Tertullian knew them, and almost no knowledge of legal practice at Carthage while he was there. The paucity of contemporary legal writings is examined and then illustrated from what we call criminal law. The implications of this for the credibility of Tertullian's challenge to the irregularity of legal proceedings against Christians concludes the first part of the article. The situation at Carthage is examined next, and illustrated from what we call civil law. Tertullian used the noun praescriptio and its cognate verb praescribo forty times in the juridical sense of 'objection' to an opponent's claim. We know that these words were employed in four different ways in litigation at Rome, but how were they used at Carthage? The second part of the article argues that three scholarly conclusions about Tertullian's use of these words are valid only if the words were used differently at Carthage from the way they were used at Rome. The article suggests that we don't know enough about the Courts at Carthage to give a definitive answer.

1. Tertullian's knowledge of Roman law

Whether Tertullian had expertise in Roman law before his conversion to Christianity, either as a *iurisconsultus* or as an *advocatus*,¹ or whether his knowledge of it was non-specialist, through studying rhetoric as part of his education,² has been debated in more than two dozen scholarly works between

¹ Jurists gave opinions but didn't appear in court; advocates pled cases in court. Siegmund Schlossman described their work and applied it to Tertullian in 'Tertullian im Lichte der Jurisprudenz', *Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte* 27 (1906), 251-75, 407-30, 257-68. A personal translation of 251-75 into English is available at <www.ianbalfour.co.uk>. For a catalogue of Tertullian's legal terminology, arranged according to subject divisions within Roman law, Paulo Vitton, *Concetti giuridici nelle opere di Tertulliano* (Rome, 1924, reissued 1972), 17-55.

² Because of Tertullian's knowledge of the Greek language and his listing of both Roman and Greek classical authors, it is generally assumed that he received a high standard of education. For how widely he read, Timothy D. Barnes, *Tertullian: An Historical and Literary Study* (Oxford, 1971, 2nd ed., London, 1984), 194-206.

12 I.L.S. Balfour

1735 and the year 2000.³ This article does not comment on that but asks, for the first time as far as I know, how far these studies recognize that we have almost no legal writings in the form in which Tertullian knew them, and almost no knowledge of legal practice at Carthage while he was there. The lack of contemporary writings will be examined in sections 2 and 3, illustrated by what we call criminal law, and the situation at Carthage examined in sections 4 and 5, illustrated by what we call civil law.⁴

Tertullian twice commented on developments in Roman law during his years at Carthage – that laws were 'daily being supplanted by new decrees and statutes' and by 'the new axes of imperial rescripts and edicts'. The concern of

- ³ The first editors or critics of Tertullian's works, such as Grotius, Valesius and Pamelius, were against Tertullian being a iurisconsultus because Jerome did not describe him as such in De viribus illustribus 53.1. Debate began when the views of Johann Heinrich Blumbach, De Senatusconsulto Quintus Septimius Florens Presbytero et Iureconcultio Tertullianus Liber (Lipsiae, 1735), 1-20, were taken up by Johannis Alexandri Guinandi Pagenstechter, De Jurisprudentia Tertulliana oratio (Harderoviae, 1743), 51. David Rankin, 'Was Tertullian a Jurist?', SP 31 (1997), 335-42, analysed nineteen studies between 1904 and 1997 and noted that Harnack, 1904; de Labriolle, 1906; Beck, 1930; Evans, 1959; Rambaux, 1978; Hallonsten, 1984 and Quasten, 1992, favoured jurist; that von Campenhausen, 1964 and Rankin himself, 1997, favoured advocate; that Schlossman, 1906; Colson, 1924; Daly, 1947; Hanson, 1961; Sider, 1971; Barnes, 1971; Fredouille, 1972; Bray, 1977; Aziza, 1977 and Waszink, 1979, favoured rhetorician or other non-legal influence. Rankin did not mention Joseph Kaspar Stirnimann, Die Praescriptio Tertullians im Lichte des römischen Rechts und der Theologie (Freiburg, Switzerland, 1949), 'very probably a jurist', 4, 82, and René Braun, who preferred causidicus (from causas dicere, to plead the cause of others before the courts as an advocate), Deus Christianorum: Recherches sur le vocabulaire doctrinal de Tertullien, Études Augustiniennes (Paris, 1962, revised ed. 1977), 18. The most determined scholarly attempt to show Tertullian as a jurist was Alexander Beck, Römisches Recht bei Tertullian und Cyprian (Halle, 1930, reprinted with extended preface, Aalen, 1967), but a key reviewer of that monograph argued that the texts assembled by Beck showed Tertullian as a causidicus, not a jurist: Artur Steinwenter, Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung für Rechtsgeschichte: Romanistische Abteilung 52 (1932), 412-6, 415. Since Rankin 'some of the features traditionally ascribed to his legal background are readily understood in terms of his expertise in the ways of rhetoric': David Wright, 'Tertullian', in Philip F. Esler (ed.), The Early Christian World, vol. 2 (London, 2000), 1032. For Roman jurists generally, see Detlef Liebs, Hofjuristen der römischen Kaiser bis Justinian (München, 2010). For the ongoing debate about the distinction between jurists and advocates, see Caroline Humfress, Orthodoxy and the Courts in Late Antiquity (Oxford, 2007).
- ⁴ When jurisdiction was conferred by the State on a Roman magistrate, he acquired all the powers necessary to deal with both crimes (*imperium merum*) and questions of private right (*imperium mixtum*); however, the boundary between criminal and civil procedure was hardly delineated at the turn of the second and third centuries: Lord Mackenzie, *Studies in Roman Law*, 7th ed. (Edinburgh, 1898), 350.
 - ⁵ Ad nationes 1.10.4: novis de die consultis constitutisque obruistis.
- ⁶ Apologeticum 4.7: novis principalium rescriptorum et edictorum securibus. Decrees were judgments given by the emperor in lawsuits; statutes were legislation by the senate, although, by the end of the second century, often the emperor's own wishes clothed with the respectability of a servile senate; rescripts were answers given by the emperor to those who consulted him; edicts were general laws laid down by the emperor. W.W. Buckland, A Text-book of Roman Law from

this article is that, for the most part, neither the old laws nor the new ones are available to us as Tertullian knew them.

2. Our knowledge of Roman law

Tertullian was a near contemporary of four lawyers described as 'the great lights of jurisprudence for all time', Gaius, Papinian, Ulpian and Paul.⁷ They were prolific writers, but none of their works has come down to us in the form in which Tertullian knew them. When the only known complete copy of the *Institutes* of Gaius, published c. 161 AD, was rediscovered in 1816 AD, the chemicals used to decipher the text damaged parts of it so badly that its contents are known only 'with the aid of many conjectures'.⁸ For example, Gaius wrote about *praescriptiones*, the subject of the fourth and fifth sections of this article, but a substantial part of his description is illegible.⁹

Almost everything which the others wrote was edited, three hundred years later, when the Emperor Justinian I appointed a Commission in 530 AD to go through about two thousand works of jurists and praetors, containing three million lines, with instructions to condense and update and publish them as contemporary law. They discarded about ninety-five percent of the material and amended and published the other five percent in 533 AD as the *Digest*. What they did not use has almost entirely disappeared, leaving us impoverished, because what is left of the jurists' work tells us more than any other writings

Augustus to Justinian, 3rd ed. (Cambridge, 1963), 17-20; Lord Mackenzie, Studies in Roman Law (Edinburgh, 1898), 14-6; Frederick P. Walton, Historical Introduction to the Roman Law, 2nd ed. (Edinburgh, 1912), 269-81.

- ⁷ Sir Henry Sumner Maine, *Ancient Law: Its Connection with the Early History of Society* (London, 1861), 41; Gaius (alive in 178), Papinian (murdered in 212), Ulpian (writing from 211-21) and Paul (dates unknown, but a contemporary of Ulpian).
- ⁸ F.P. Walton, *Historical Introduction* (1912), 289. Gaius' *Institutes* disappeared after the fall of the Roman Empire, until an almost compete copy was discovered in Verona in 1816.
- ⁹ Gaius, *Institutes*, 4, 130-7. 'Gaius distinguishes between *praescr. pro actore* (130-1a, 134-7) and *pro reo* (133). The illegible page after 133 must have contained more about *praes. p. reo* before it returned, by a train of thought which is irrecoverable, to *praescr. p. actore*.' Francis de Zulueta, *The Institutes of Gaius* (Oxford, 1953), II 285. Furthermore, the text we possess had been altered over many years after Gaius published it as copyists incorporated glosses written in the margins of manuscripts into the text: W.W. Buckland, *A Text-book of Roman Law* (1963), 25.
- ¹⁰ *Ibid.* 40, 42. 'Almost everything': most of what else we have from the classical age is described in *ibid.* 34-39; other works of less importance were collected by Gustavus Haenel, *Corpus Juris Antejustinianeum*, 5th ed. (Leipzig, 1886).
- Justinian, *C. Tanta* 1 said that the Commissioners read nearly 2,000 *libri*, containing three million *versus* (lines) and reduced them to 150,000 *versus* five percent; H.F. Jolowicz and Barry Nicholas, *Historical Introduction to the Study of Roman Law*, 3rd ed. (Cambridge, 1972), 482, suggest that only 1,528 *libri* were consulted, not 'nearly 2,000', which increases the 'five percent'.

about the law of the classical age.¹² 'There is moreover the probability that some of these texts reached Justinian's compilers in a form which had already been altered to some extent in the immediately post-classical period.'¹³ The Commission's amendments are known as 'Interpolations' and much ingenuity has been exercised to date them.¹⁴ Our knowledge of what Tertullian knew is even more restricted, because the *Institutes* of Gaius' do not mention criminal law and Justinian's *Corpus Iuris Civilis*¹⁵ dealt, as the name says, almost entirely with civil law.¹⁶

3. Tertullian's 'ignorance' of Roman law – or is it ours?

The clincher of Timothy Barnes' argument that Tertullian was not a *iuris-consultus* was twofold: (1) that Tertullian 'never makes this telling point' that 'no specific *lex, senatus consultum* or imperial decree proscribed Christianity as illegal', ¹⁷ and (2) that Tertullian did not mention a work where Ulpian listed imperial pronouncements about punishment of Christians. ¹⁸ Barnes pronounced Tertullian 'ignorant' of Roman law on both counts. ¹⁹ While Christianity was

- ¹² The classical age of Roman law, its golden period, was from the beginning of the second century to the middle of the third. 'Other writings' include imperial rescripts embodied in various collections of the later empire.
 - ¹³ H.F. Jolowicz and B. Nicholas, *Historical Introduction* (1972), 405.
- ¹⁴ W.W. Buckland, *A Text-book of Roman Law* (1963), 43-4. Justinian said that the amendments were *multa et maxima* (*C. Tanta* 10), as centuries-old texts were adapted to expound existing law.
- ¹⁵ The *Digest* and three other works commissioned by Justinian have been collectively known as the *Corpus Iuris Civilis* since Denys Godefroi used the phrase for his 1583 edition, to distinguish it from the compilation of Canon Law called *Corpus Juris Canonici*.
- ¹⁶ For Gaius, Lord Mackenzie, *Studies in Roman Law* (1898), 396; for Justinian, only a small section at the end of the fourth book of the *Digest*, 4.18, and the last title of his *Institutes*, touched on criminal law.
 - ¹⁷ Tertullian (1971), 27.
- ¹⁸ A chapter in the seventh book of Ulpian's *De officio proconsularis*. Unsurprisingly, there is no trace of it in Justinian's *Digest*, because his Commissioners had no interest in now-obsolete laws about persecution of Christians; we know about it only because it was quoted by a Christian writer, Lactantius, early in the fourth century, in his *Divinae institutiones* V 11.19 an example of how fragmented is our knowledge of criminal law in Tertullian's time.
- ¹⁹ Tertullian (1971), 28. The second point is scarcely fair because, as far as we know, Ulpian's work was not available until 211, more than a decade after Tertullian's main challenge to the irregularity of proceedings against Christians in *Ad nationes* and *Apologeticum* in 197. Of the many attempts to construct a chronology for Tertullian's writings, two of the most recent Jean-Claude Fredouille, *Tertullien et la conversion de la culture antique*, Collection des Études Augustiniennes, Série Antiquité 47 (Paris, 1972), 487 and T.D. Barnes, *Tertullian* (1971), 55 agree on dating both *Ad nationes* and *Apologeticum* in 197. Tertullian's only other work about the legality of persecution was an open letter in 212 to Scapula, the Proconsul of Africa from 211-213, but we don't know if Ulpian's *De officio proconsularis* was available to Tertullian then.

illegal – there is no doubt about that – Barnes' first point was that no enactment before 250 AD made it so and that Trajan's advisory rescript to Pliny, *conquirendi non sunt*²⁰ (not to be sought out), defined the legal position of Christianity until Decius, but didn't proscribe it. 'There is no evidence to prove earlier legislation by the Senate or the emperor.'²¹ There may be no extant laws, but Tertullian's point, in his carefully reasoned appeal to the 'leaders of Rome' who met on the Byrsa at Carthage,²² was that Trajan's rescript ameliorated existing *leges* (Tertullian's word).²³ Would he have jeopardized his credibility by saying that, if his opponents could have responded in ridicule, 'but there were no such laws'?

We do not know what *leges* Tertullian was referring to, but if many if not most of the legal writings which he knew, and his readers knew, have been lost, perhaps 'ignorance' of them is not Tertullian's but ours? Barnes elsewhere accepted that 'it is not clear whether Trajan, in his reply, made a change in the legal position of Christians or not'.²⁴ In short, we just don't have the legal records as Tertullian knew and used them.

So much for the general position; what about the local situation at Carthage?

4. Roman law at Carthage

Many efforts have been made to understand Tertullian's use of the noun *praescriptio* and its cognate verb *praescribo*, appearing 106 times across twenty-five of his thirty-one extant works.²⁵ This article looks only at his forty

- ²⁰ Pliny, Epistulae 10.97.2.
- ²¹ Timothy D. Barnes, 'Legislation against the Christians', *The Journal of Roman Studies* 58 (1968), 32-50, 48. He scrutinized twenty 'scattered and often difficult to evaluate' passages, six of them quoted by Tertullian, attributed to fourteen emperors, and argued that none of them went further than the guidance given by Trajan to Pliny (my footnote 20). In his monograph, *Tertullian* (1971), 27, Barnes added *lex* to the list: 'No specific *lex*, *senatus consultum* or imperial decree proscribed Christianity as illegal.' He disagreed with John A. Crook, *Life and Law of Rome* (London, 1967), 279: 'The equation "Christian = man to be punished" can only have been established by government directive.' After commenting that Nero may have provided a precedent, Crook added: 'This is not enough. There must have been a legal order, a rescript to the urban prefect or something of the sort.'
- ²² Most are now agreed that *Apologeticum* was addressed to the 'leaders of Rome' who met on the Byrsa at Carthage and not to the leaders in Rome itself; T.D. Barnes, *Tertullian* (1971), 109.
- ²³ Apologeticum 5.7: Quales ergo leges istae ... quas Traianus ex parte frustrates est vetanda inquiri Christianos.
 - ²⁴ 'Legislation against the Christians' (1968), 37.
- ²⁵ J.-C. Fredouille, *Tertullien et la conversion* (1972), 196-218, 232-4, counted 106 usages and showed that the words have two meanings in Tertullian's works, (1) forty-two places where the secular meaning 'preface' or 'information given in advance' had acquired the technical value in juridical language of 'prior objection', and (2) sixty-four places where the meaning was 'rule' or 'precept'. He went on to show how Tertullian combined the two meanings into a 'personal

16 I.L.S. Balfour

or so uses of these words in the juridical sense of 'objection' to an opponent's claim. ²⁶ Despite the reservations in the first part of this article, we know that *praescriptio* was employed in four different ways in litigation at Rome, ²⁷ but how was it used at Carthage? It is a fair question, because until the third century Rome made no attempt to impose a unified system of law on the diverse peoples of her Empire; until then, Phoenecian and Berber laws and customs inter-related with Roman law at Carthage. ²⁸ Noting that Gaius' *Institutes* do not mention acquiring title to land by *praescriptio*, one commentator surmised '... probably in his day there was no general system, the matter being left to the particular law of each province', ²⁹ and another said more generally, that 'Roman law was in practice probably interpreted in the light of local traditions'. ³⁰

'Probably' is the key word. 'The literature of the classical period was mostly written from the standpoint of Rome, ... Even when the great jurists of the capital have provincial cases in mind, they are representative of the official point of view, which is conservative and Roman.'³¹ Furthermore, almost all the works quoted in Justinian's *Digest* were by lawyers who lived in Rome;³²

semantic neologism' (néologisme sémantique personnel) – an example of Tertullian taking a word with a technical meaning and using it in a non-technical sense.

- ²⁶ The first to distinguish juridical and non-juridical uses of *praescriptio* in Tertullian's works was Jean-Léon Allie, *L'argument de prescription dans le droit romaine, en apologétique et en théologie dogmatique* (Ottawa, 1940), 48. In 1949, J. Stirnimann identified thirty-nine of Tertullian's uses of *praescriptio* as having juridical meaning: *Die Praescriptio Tertullians* (1949), 83-5. In 1970, Dimitri Michaélidès listed everything previously written on this in *Sacramentum chez Tertullien* (Paris, 1970), 154-62, and supported the traditional view that Tertullian took the word from a judicial background.
- 27 For the rest of this paper, the noun and the verb are both encompassed by the one word, praescriptio.
- ²⁸ Jean-Michel Carrié, 'Developments in provincial and local administration', in A.K. Bowman, P. Garnsey and A. Cameron (eds), *The Cambridge Ancient History*, 2nd ed, vol. XII, *The Crisis of Empire A.D. 193-337* (Cambridge, 2005), 269-309; he dated Carthage's transition from 'a Latin colony to a colony under Italic law' at c. 208 (271). Caroline Humfrees broadly concurred with his conclusions, but saw provincial cities increasingly choosing to use Roman law, rather than having it imposed on them, after Caracalla's *Constitutio Antoniniana* granted Roman citizenship to almost all free inhabitants of the Roman Empire in 212: 'Law's Empire: Roman Universalism and Legal Practice', in Paul J. du Plessis (ed.), *New Frontiers, Law and Society in the Roman World* (Edinburgh, 2013), 77-90.
 - ²⁹ F. Zulueta, *The Institutes of Gaius* (1953), II 70-1.
- ³⁰ Greg Woolf, *Becoming Roman: the Origins of Provincial Civilization in Gaul* (Cambridge, 1998), 67, illustrated by one of Trajan's letters to Pliny, who had written for advice because several cities claimed they were exempt from the usual laws on bankruptcy. Trajan replied: 'It depends on the charter of each city. If they have such a privilege, uphold it, but I am making no general rule to the detriment of private creditors.' Pliny, *Epistulae* 10.108-9.
 - ³¹ H.F. Jolowicz and B. Nicholas, *Historical Introduction* (1972), 405.
- ³² Paul Monceaux, *Histoire littéraire de l'Afrique chrétienne depuis les origines jusqu'à l'invasion arabe* (Paris, 1901), II 181.

Gaius does not mention Carthage and the *Digest* refers to it only once.³³ Even if Tertullian lived in Rome for a while – doubted by some³⁴ – he was brought up in Carthage,³⁵ which had its own law school,³⁶ yet we know almost nothing about regional variations of Roman law (if any) at Carthage. With two caveats, the remainder of this article examines four scholarly views about Tertullian's use of *praescriptio*, and argues that three of them can be valid only if the word was used differently at Carthage from the way it was used at Rome. The first caveat acknowledges that Tertullian transposed the judicial use of *praescriptiones* into theological ones, which 'oscillate between various shades of meaning, according to the context'.³⁷ Jean-Claude Fredouille remarked on the irony that the word chosen by Tertullian to silence heretics 'simply, quickly and effectively' has led 'the learned ... to a disconcerting variety of conclusions'.³⁸ The second caveat is that neither the number of *praescriptiones* used by Tertullian – opinion has ranged from one to ten³⁹ – nor the adjectives he added to

³⁶ Franz Peter Bremer, *Die Rechtslehrer und Rechtsschulen im römischen Kaiserreich* (Berlin, 1868), 571; Berhhard Kübler, *Geschichte des römischen Rechts* (Leipzig, 1925), 258.

- ³⁷ '... oscillent, selon les contextes, entre diverses nuances', so J.-C. Fredouille, *Tertullien et* la conversion (1972), 218. Similarly, 'Tertullian ... keeps of the Roman procedure only the framework, and the general idea of prescription, for he transposes this juridical expedient into the theological domain, and gives it a quite different meaning' ('Tertullien ... ne garde de la procédure romaine que le cadre et l'idée générale de prescription, car il transpose cet expédient juridique dans la domaine théologique et lui donne un contenu tout différent' [own trans.]). R.F. Refoulé in Tertullien: Traité de la prescription contre les hérétiques, edited and translated by R.F. Refoulé and P. De Labriolle (Paris, 1957), 24. Likewise J. Stirnimann, Die Praescriptio Tertullians (1949), 93: 'These examples demonstrate sufficiently that Tertullian takes over the praescriptio of the Roman lawsuit only in its outer form. He fills the praescriptio with a completely new content and puts it in the service of the apologism. He transfers the praescriptio of the lawsuit into the language of theology. The juridical praescriptio becomes a theological praescriptio in the hand of Tertullian' ('Diese Beispiele legen zur Genüge dar, dass Tertullian die Präskription des römischen Prozesses nur in ihrer äussern Form übernimmt. Er erfüllt die Präskription mit ganz neuem Inhalt und stellt sie in den Dienst der Apologetik. Er transponiert die Präskription des Prozesses in die Sprache der Theologie. Die juristische Präskription wird in der Hand Tertullians eine theologische Präskription' [own trans.]).
- ³⁸ 'Ironie ... son avantage n'est-il pas, aux yeux de Tertullien, sa simplicité, sa brièveté, son efficacité? ... stimulé la perspicacité des érudites ... tant la diversité de leurs conclusions est déconcertante', *Tertullien et la Conversion* (1972), 195.
- ³⁹ R.F. Refoulé, *Tertullien: Traité de la prescription* (1957), 25-6, cited Mgr Freppel, P. Monceaux, P. de Labriolle and G. Bardy as finding one *prescriptio*; D. van den Eynde as finding two; G. Esser, K. Adam, A. d'Alès, B. Altaner and P. Battifol as finding three (the most popular view

³³ Digest 32.11. pr.

³⁴ Johannes Quasten summarized the pre-Barnes majority view that Tertullian lived in Rome, although he provided no conjecture as to dates: *Patrology* (Utrecht and Brussels, 1963), II 246; following T.D. Barnes' view that *gemmarum quoque nobilitatem uidemus Romae* (*De cultu feminarum* 1.7.2) was not intended to be autobiographical (*Tertullian* [1971], 245), recent scholarship has largely ignored the question.

³⁵ It is widely accepted that Africa Proconsularis was his *patria* or homeland, although he himself never dwelt on autobiographical details and no extant contemporary writer mentions him: Geoffrey D. Dunn, *Tertullian* (London, 2004), 4.

them,⁴⁰ nor the *praescriptio longi temporis*, which he didn't mention by name but some scholars believe he had in mind,⁴¹ affect the remainder of this article.

5. Four praescriptiones at Rome

5.1. A plaintiff's praescriptio in formulary procedure

Ordinary litigation at Rome in Tertullian's time was in two stages, known as the 'formulary procedure', 42 because a praetor prepared a written *formula*, outlining the issues, and forwarded it to a *iudex*, who decided the case. 43 A plaintiff could ask the praetor to enter a *praescriptio pro actore* because, as the name says, it was written at the beginning of the *formula*. 44 This kept the plaintiff's options open. For example, if a creditor was suing for money payable

until J. Stirnimann, *Die Praescriptio Tertullians* [1949], 50-4, 127-34, established two); U. Hüntemann as finding four and J.L. Aillie as finding up to ten. Refoulé came down in favour of two (30-1), but didn't acknowledge Stirnimann's analysis which established this, although he did commend Stirnimann for making 'un progrès décisif à l'interprétation de cet ouvrage' (8). Stirnimann's work was taken forward by André Sergène, 'Tertullien "de praescriptione haereticorum" XXXVII, 4 et la "longi temporis praescriptio", in *Études offertes à Jean Macqueron* (Aixen-Provence, 1970), 605-12. The two *praescriptiones* which they identified were that heretics have no right to use scripture (*De praescriptione haereticorum* 1-15) and that only the universal Catholic Church has communion with the Apostolic Church (*Ibid.* 21).

⁴⁰ He added only two adjectives to *praescriptio* in its judicial sense – *praescriptio novitatis* (*Adversus Marcionem* 1.1.6-7) and *originis praescriptionem* (*Ad nationes* 2.12.37-8). The priority of truth over error was a main part of his general argument in his antiheretical treatises, but he did not rely only on this technical point and wrote detailed refutations of the individual doctrines of Hermogenes, Marcion and Praxeas.

⁴¹ Tertullian did not use the phrase *praescriptio longi temporis* but many have seen it in *De praescriptione haereticorum* 37, where he stressed the priority of the Church's possession of Scripture. In both formulary and cognition procedure (5.1 and 5.4 below), a person with uninterrupted possession of property over a defined period, who fulfilled other conditions, could ask to be given occupancy rights or even ownership; this was called *praescriptio longi temporis*, even when invoked by a defendant in a formula. Tertullian's use of it (without naming it) was first suggested in 1906 by Joseph Partsch, *Die* longi temporis praescriptio *im klassischen römischen Rechte* (Leipzig, 1906), 76, 109; he was followed by Umberto Moricca, *Storia della letteratura latina christiana* (Turin, 1923), I, 195-6. The idea was fully explored by J. Stirnimann, *Die Praescriptio Tertullians* (1949), 28-36, 99-126, who concluded that Tertullian 'pointed to it rather than used it' (126), because Stirnimann thought it implied the Church's title to Scripture was acquired rather than inherited, and by R.F. Refoulé, *Tertullien: Traité de la prescription* (1957), 32-6. A balanced antidote to Stirnimann's concern is Henry Chadwick's review of Stirnimann's monograph in *The JTS* n.s. 1 (1950), 210-1.

⁴² Summarized and applied to Tertullian by J. Stirnimann, *Die Praescriptio Tertullians* (1949), 11-27, and by R.F. Refoulé, *Tertullien: Traité de la prescription* (1957), 20-4, both citing authorities on Roman law and both identifying Tertullian's *praescriptio* as taken from the cognition procedure (5.4 below).

⁴³ For the role of the practor and the *iudex*, J.A. Crook, *Law and Life of Rome* (1967), 73-83.

⁴⁴ Gaius, *Institutes* 4.132.

by instalments, he might enter a *praescriptio* that this case was about only the overdue instalment, and not the whole debt.⁴⁵

Herbert Bindley in 1893⁴⁶ and James Morgan in 1928⁴⁷ believed that Tertullian based his *praescriptio* on this.⁴⁸ However, at Rome it was available only to plaintiffs who, by definition, wanted their case to proceed, safeguarded by their *praescriptio*. Tertullian's *praescriptio*, by contrast, was intended to paralyse the heretics' claim without their being heard. Unless the Courts at Carthage used *praescriptio pro actore* differently from the Courts at Rome – and that we don't know – it could not have been Tertullian's source.

5.2. A defendant's praescriptio in formulary procedure

A defendant could ask the praetor to incorporate a preliminary plea; to continue the example of a suit for money, a debtor might admit the loan but plead a subsequent agreement to extend the repayment date. This was originally called *praescriptio pro reo* but by Tertullian's time it had been renamed at Rome as *exceptio*.⁴⁹ Dimitri Michaélidès in 1969⁵⁰ and Peter Jones in 1973 believed that Tertullian used *praescriptio* 'in the older sense of the term'.⁵¹ That

- ⁴⁵ An example given by Gaius, *Institutes* 4.131.
- ⁴⁶ Thomas Herbert Bindley, *Tertulliani*, *De Praescriptione Haereticorum: Ad Martyras: Ad Scapulam* (Oxford, 1893), 4.
- ⁴⁷ James Morgan, *The Importance of Tertullian in the Development of Christian Dogma* (London, 1928), 28.
- ⁴⁸ They said that Tertullian saw the Church as plaintiff and the heretics as defendants; most scholars see it the other way round. J.-C. Fredouille said that he found it *difficile* to see Tertullian's *praescriptio* as the *praescriptio pro reo* of the formulary procedure, but 'if one insists absolutely on again finding in this treatise the circumstances of a law-suit, it would be necessary to concede that Tertullian is taking part ... not as the defence counsel, but rather as the prosecutor' ('si l'on tient absolument à retrouver dans ce traité les conditions d'une action en justice, il faudrait admettre que Tertullien fait figure ... non pas de défendeur, mais bien de demandeur' [own trans.]), *Tertullien et la Conversion* (1972), 224-5.
- ⁴⁹ Gaius, *Institutes* 4.133: 'In our days, as already stated, all the *praescriptiones* are introduced by the plaintiff; formerly, some were introduced by the defendant' (*His temporibus, omnes praescriptiones ab actore profisciscuntur. Olim autem quaedam et pro reo opponebantur* [own trans.]) Lord Mackenzie, *Studies in Roman Law* (1898), 365. It was entered at the end of the *formula*; the *iudex* had to look at the merits of the plaintiff's case before deciding whether the defendant's *objectio* answered it. Tertullian used *exceptio* only once, to make a different point, saying that 'there is no *exceptio* which protects those people who don't know the Lord' (*Cum etiam ignorantes dominum nulla exceptio tueatur ad poenam: De paenitentia* 5). It was therefore not a synonym for *praescriptio* for Tertullian.
 - ⁵⁰ Foi, Écritures et Tradition, Les 'praescriptiones' chez Tertullien (Paris, 1969).
- ⁵¹ Peter W. Jones, *The Concept of Community in Tertullian's Writings, in the Light of Contemporary, Legal, Philosophical and Literary Influences*, Ph.D. thesis presented to McGill University (Montreal, 1973); the quotation is from Part 1, end of Chapter 4. The problem with this understanding of *praescriptio* is that a defendant's *praescriptio* in this sense did not deny the accuracy of the plaintiff's claim but introduced a new factor, such as the example given about the

20 I.L.S. Balfour

can be correct only if the Courts at Carthage were more conservative and traditional than those at Rome, still using *praescriptio* although Rome had renamed it *exceptio*. Was that so? We don't know.

5.3. A defendant's praescriptio dealt with by a praetor

If a defendant's objection was fundamental to the case, for example that the Court had no jurisdiction, the praetor didn't append it to a *formula* and send it to a *iudex*, but ruled on the objection himself. This was known at Rome as *praescriptio fori*. Philip Schaff in 1884 identified this as Tertullian's source; ⁵³ Joseph Stirnimann in 1949 said that 'perhaps' Tertullian employed it in this sense. Was it used in this way at Carthage while Tertullian was there? We don't know.

5.4. Praescriptio in cognition procedure

By Tertullian's time,⁵⁵ the rigidity of the formulary procedure had made it increasingly unfit for purpose, so in a typically Roman way of reforming the law, a new and more flexible procedure, *cognitio extraordinaria*, was introduced alongside the old, letting the old die gradually away. It 'assumed different forms at different periods and in different parts of the empire'.⁵⁶ In it, a single judicial officer, not a praetor, dealt with the whole case and *praescriptio* (not *exceptio*) was used for every kind of defence.⁵⁷

suit for money, which set aside the usual outcome of the claim. As mentioned at 5.1, Tertullian's *praescriptio* admitted nothing and denied heretics the right even to be heard.

- ⁵² 'A formal objection to a claim against a person based on the tribunal's lack of jurisdiction over the person objecting.' Aaron X. Fellmeth and Maurice Horwitz, *Guide to Latin in International Law* (Oxford, 2009), taken from *praescriptio fori* in the 2011 on-line version.
- 53 '... before the merits of the case are discussed, showing *in limine* that the plaintiff ought not to be heard', *History of the Church* (Edinburgh, 1884), II 830.
- ⁵⁴ *Die Praescriptio Tertullians* (1949), 19, 26. He accepted that Roman lawyers used the phrase but contended at 19 that they did so in the cognition procedure (5.4 below). However at 26 he said that 'perhaps' Tertullian used it as a praetor would in making a judgement, although he believed that the praetor's role had disappeared in the provinces by Tertullian's time.
- ⁵⁵ William Turpin, *Formula*, *cognitio*, *and proceedings extra ordinem*, http://local.droit.ulg.ac.be/sa/rida/file/1999/TURPIN.pdf (accessed on August 31, 2015).
- ⁵⁶ H.F. Jolowicz and B. Nicholas, *Historical Introduction* (1972), 406-8. The two processes existed side by side for a long time. The cognition procedure made quicker progress in the provinces than in conservative Rome. Jolowitz and Nicholas suggested two reasons for this: (1) provincial governors were permitted more initiative than the praetors at Rome, and (2) they couldn't find enough suitable *iudices* it was an unpaid appointment (408). The formulary procedure remained available until Diocletian enacted in 294 that all cases should be heard from beginning to end by one judicial officer, but it remained in use by habit until expressly abolished by the sons of Constantine in 342.
 - ⁵⁷ Digest 44.1. C.7.40. 8.35.

In 1906, J. Partsch identified this as Tertullians's source;⁵⁸ Joseph Stirnimann in 1949 and R.F. Refoulé in 1957 agreed with him.⁵⁹ If they are correct, the Courts at Carthage were more progressive than those at Rome, using the cognition procedure while Rome kept the formulary procedure as the norm until the middle of the third century; were they? We don't know.

6. Conclusion

This article suggests that the contemporary significance at Carthage of some of the legal words used by Tertullian is not available to us, and that we should allow for this in our understanding of his works.

⁵⁸ Die longi temporis praescriptio im klassischen römischen Rechte (1906), 71.

⁵⁹ J. Stirnimann, *Die Praescriptio Tertullians* (1949), 1, 20-7, 86-7, 96; R.F. Refoulé, *Tertullien: Traité de la prescription* (1957), 23-4, although Refoulé disagreed with Partsch on which *praescriptio* Tertullian used.

Volume 1

STUDIA PATRISTICA LXXV

STUDIA PATRISTICA

Markus Vinzent Editing Studia Patristica	3
Frances Young Studia Patristica	11
Mark EDWARDS The Use and Abuse of Patristics	15
PLATONISM AND THE FATHERS	
Christian H. Bull An Origenistic Reading of Plato in Nag Hammadi Codex VI	31
Mark Huggins Comparing the Ethical Concerns of Plato and John Chrysostom	41
Alexey Fokin Act of Vision as an Analogy of the Proceeding of the Intellect from the One in Plotinus and of the Son and the Holy Spirit from the Father in Marius Victorinus and St. Augustine	55
Laela ZWOLLO Aflame in Love: St. Augustine's Doctrine of <i>amor</i> and Plotinus' Notion of <i>eros</i>	69
Lenka Karfíková Augustine on Recollection between Plato and Plotinus	81
Matthias SMALBRUGGE Augustine and Deification. A Neoplatonic Way of Thinking	103
Douglas A. Shepardson The Analogical Methodology of Plato's <i>Republic</i> and Augustine's <i>De trinitate</i>	109

MAXIMUS CONFESSOR

Paul A. Brazinski Maximus the Confessor and Constans II: A Punishment Fit for an Unruly Monk	119
Ian M. GERDON The Evagrian Roots of Maximus the Confessor's <i>Liber asceticus</i>	
Jonathan Greig Proclus' Doctrine of Participation in Maximus the Confessor's Centuries of Theology 1.48-50	137
Emma Brown Dewhurst The 'Divisions of Nature' in Maximus' Ambiguum 41?	149
Michael Bakker Gethsemane Revisited: Maximos' <i>Aporia</i> of Christ's γνώμη and a 'Monarchic Psychology' of Deciding	155
Christopher A. Beeley Natural and Gnomic Willing in Maximus Confessor's <i>Disputation</i> with Pyrrhus	167
Jonathan Taylor A Three-Nativities Christology? Maximus on the <i>Logos</i>	181
Eric Lopez Plagued by a Thousand Passions – Maximus the Confessor's Vision of Love in Light of Nationalism, Ethnocentrism, and Religious Persecution	189
Manuel Mira The Priesthood in Maximus the Confessor	201
Adam G. COOPER When Action Gives Way to Passion: The Paradoxical Structure of the Human Person according to Maximus the Confessor	213
Jonathan Bieler Body and Soul Immovably Related: Considering an Aspect of Maximus the Confessor's Concept of Analogy	223

Luke STEVEN Deification and the Workings of the Body: The Logic of 'Proportion' in Maximus the Confessor	237
Paul M. BLOWERS Recontextualizations of Maximus the Confessor in Modern Christian Theology	251
Volume 2 STUDIA PATRISTICA LXXVI	
EL PLATONISMO EN LOS PADRES DE LA IGLESIA (ed. Rubén Pereto Rivas)	
Rubén Peretó Rivas Introducción	1
Viviana Laura FÉLIX Platonismo y reflexión trinitaria en Justino	3
Juan Carlos Alby El trasfondo platónico del concepto de <i>Lex divina</i> en Ireneo de Lyon	23
Patricia CINER La Herencia Espiritual: la doctrina de la preexistencia en Platón y Orígenes	37
Pedro Daniel Fernández Raíces platónicas del modelo pedagógico de Orígenes	49
Rubén Peretó Rivas La <i>eutonía</i> en la dinámica psicológica de Evagrio Póntico	59
Santiago Hernán VAZQUEZ El ensalmo curativo de Platón y la potencialidad terapeútica de la palabra en Evagrio Póntico	67
Oscar Velásquez Las <i>Confesiones</i> en la perspectiva de la Caverna de Platón	79

Acerca de la belleza metafísica en Pseudo-Dionisio y Buenaventura	91
Graciela L. RITACCO La perennidad del legado patrístico: Tiempo y eternidad	103
Volume 3	
STUDIA PATRISTICA LXXVII	
BECOMING CHRISTIAN IN THE LATE ANTIQUE WEST (3rd-6th CENTURIES)	
(ed. Ariane Bodin, Camille Gerzaguet and Matthieu Pignot)	
Ariane Bodin, Camille Gerzaguet & Matthieu Pignot Introduction	1
Matthieu PIGNOT The Catechumenate in Anonymous Sermons from the Late Antique West	11
Camille Gerzaguet Preaching to the <i>ecclesia</i> in Northern Italy: The Eastertide Sermons of Zeno of Verona and Gaudentius of Brescia	33
Adrian Brändli Imagined Kinship: Perpetua and the Paternity of God	45
Jarred MERCER Vox infantis, vox Dei: The Spirituality of Children and Becoming Christian in Late Antiquity	59
Rafał Toczko The Shipwrecks and Philosophers: The Rhetoric of Aristocratic Conversion in the Late 4 th and Early 5 th Centuries	75
Ariane Bodin Identifying the Signs of Christianness in Late Antique Italy and	01

Hervé HUNTZINGER Becoming Christian, Becoming Roman: Conversion to Christianity and Ethnic Identification Process in Late Antiquity	103
Volume 4	
STUDIA PATRISTICA LXXVIII	
LITERATURE, RHETORIC, AND EXEGESE IN SYRIAC VERSE (ed. Jeffrey Wickes and Kristian S. Heal)	
Jeffrey Wickes Introduction	1
Sidney H. GRIFFITH The Poetics of Scriptural Reasoning: Syriac <i>Mêmrê</i> at Work	5
Kristian S. HEAL Construction of <i>Genesis</i> in Early Syriac Sermons	25
Carl Griffin Vessel of Wrath: Judas Iscariot in Cyrillona and Early Syriac Tradition	33
Susan Ashbrook Harvey The Poet's Prayer: Invocational Prayers in the <i>Mêmrê</i> of Jacob of Sarug	51
Andrew J. Hayes The Manuscripts and Themes of Jacob of Serugh's <i>Mêmrâ</i> 'On the Adultery of the Congregation'	61
Robert A. KITCHEN Three Young Men Redux: The Fiery Furnace in Jacob of Sarug and Narsai	73
Erin Galgay Walsh Holy Boldness: Narsai and Jacob of Serugh Preaching the Canaanite Woman	85
Scott Fitzgerald JOHNSON Biblical Historiography in Verse Exegesis: Jacob of Sarug on Elijah and Elisha	99

Volume 5 STUDIA PATRISTICA LXXIX

CLEMENT OF ALEXANDRIA

(ed. Piotr Ashwin-Siejkowski)

Piotr Ashwin-Siejkowski Introduction	1
Judith L. Kovacs 'In order that we might follow him in all things': Interpretation of Gospel Texts in <i>Excerpts from Theodotus</i> 66-86	7
Veronika ČERNUŠKOVÁ The <i>Eclogae Propheticae</i> on the Value of Suffering: A Copyist's Excerpts or Clement's Preparatory Notes?	29
Piotr Ashwin-Siejkowski Excerpta ex Theodoto – A Search for the Theological Matrix. An Examination of the Document in the Light of Some Coptic Treatises from the Nag Hammadi Library	55
Jana Plátová How Many Fragments of the <i>Hypotyposes</i> by Clement of Alexandria Do We Actually Have?	71
Davide DAINESE Cassiodorus' Adumbrationes: Do They Belong to Clement's Hypotyposeis?	87
Joshua A. Noble Almsgiving or Training? Clement of Alexandria's Answer to Quis dives salvetur?	101
Peter Widdicombe Slave, Son, Friend, and Father in the Writings of Clement of Alexandria	109
H. CLIFTON WARD We Hold These ἀρχαί Το Be Self-Evident: Clement, ἐνάργεια, and the Search for Truth	123
Annette Bourland Huizenga Clement's Use of Female Role Models as a Pedagogical Strategy	133

Brice ROGERS 'Trampling on the Garment of Shame': Clement of Alexandria's Use of the Gospel of the Egyptians in Anti-Gnostic Polemic	145
Manabu Akiyama L'Unigenito Dio come «esegeta» (Gv. 1:18) secondo Clemente Alessandrino	153
Lisa RADAKOVICH HOLSBERG Of Gods and Men (and Music) in Clement of Alexandria's <i>Protrepticus</i>	161
Joona Salminen Clement of Alexandria on Laughter	171
Antoine Paris La composition des <i>Stromates</i> comme subversion de la logique aristotélicienne	181
Volume 6 STUDIA PATRISTICA LXXX	
THE CLASSICAL OR CHRISTIAN LACTANTIUS (ed. Oliver Nicholson)	
Oliver Nicholson Introduction	1
John McGuckin The Problem of Lactantius the Theologian	17
Mattias Gassman Et Deus et Homo: The Soteriology of Lactantius	35
Gábor Kendeffy More than a <i>Cicero Christianus</i> . Remarks on Lactantius' Dualistic System	43
Stefan Freund When Romans Become Christians The 'Romanisation' of Christian Doctrine in Lactantius' Divine Institutes	63

Lactantius and the Philosophy of Cicero: 'Romideologie' and Legit-imization of Christianity	79
Jackson Bryce Lactantius' Poetry and Poetics	97
Oliver NICHOLSON The Christian Sallust: Lactantius on God, Man and History	119
Elizabeth DePalma Digeser Persecution and the Art of Reading: Lactantius, Porphyry and the Rules for Reading Sacred Texts	139
David RUTHERFORD The Manuscripts of Lactantius and His Early Renaissance Readers.	155
Carmen M. PALOMO PINEL The Survival of the Classical Idea of Justice in Lactantius' Work	173
Ralph Keen Gilbert Burnet and Lactantius' De mortibus persecutorum	183
Volume 7	
STUDIA PATRISTICA LXXXI	
HEALTH, MEDICINE, AND CHRISTIANITY IN LATE ANTIQUITY (ed. Jared Secord, Heidi Marx-Wolf and Christoph Markschies)	
Jared Secord Introduction: Medicine beyond Galen in the Roman Empire and Late Antiquity	1
METHODOLOGICAL CONSIDERATIONS	
Christoph Markschies Demons and Disease	11
Ellen MUEHLBERGER Theological Anthropology and Medicine: Questions and Directions for Research	37

CHRISTIANS, DOCTORS, AND MEDICAL KNOWLEDGE	
Jared SECORD Galen and the Theodotians: Embryology and Adoptionism in the Christian Schools of Rome	51
Róbert Somos Origen on the Kidneys	65
Heidi Marx-Wolf The Good Physician: Imperial Doctors and Medical Professionalization in Late Antiquity	79
Stefan Hodges-Kluck Religious Education and the Health of the Soul according to Basil of Caesarea and the Emperor Julian	91
Jessica Wright John Chrysostom and the Rhetoric of Cerebral Vulnerability	109
CHRISTIAN PERSPECTIVES ON DEATH, DISABILITY, AND ILLNESS	
Helen Rhee Portrayal of Patients in Early Christian Writings	127
Meghan Henning Metaphorical, Punitive, and Pedagogical Blindness in Hell	139
Maria E. DOERFLER The Sense of an Ending: Childhood Death and Parental Benefit in Late Ancient Rhetoric	153
Brenda Llewellyn IHSSEN 'Waiting to see and know': Disgust, Fear and Indifference in <i>The Miracles of St. Artemios</i>	161
CONCEPTIONS OF VIRGINITY	
Michael Rosenberg Physical Virginity in the <i>Protevangelium of James</i> , the Mishnah, and Late Antique Syriac Poetry	177

Julia Kelto Lillis Who Opens the Womb? Fertility and Virginity in Patristic Texts	187
Caroline Musgrove Debating Virginity in the Late Alexandrian School of Medicine	203
Volume 8	
STUDIA PATRISTICA LXXXII	
DEMONS (ed. Sophie Lunn-Rockliffe)	
Sophie Lunn-Rockliffe Introduction	1
Gregory SMITH Augustine on Demons' Bodies	7
Sophie Lunn-Rockliffe Chaotic Mob or Disciplined Army? Collective Bodies of Demons in Ascetic Literature	33
Travis W. PROCTOR Dining with 'Inhuman' Demons: Greco-Roman Sacrifice, Demonic Ritual, and the Christian Body in Clement of Alexandria	51
Gregory Wiebe Augustine on Diabolical Sacraments and the Devil's Body	73
Katie HAGER CONROY 'A Kind of Lofty Tribunal': The Gathering of Demons for Judgment in Cassian's Conference Eight	91
Volume 9	
STUDIA PATRISTICA LXXXIII	
EMOTIONS (ed. Yannis Papadogiannakis)	
Yannis PAPADOGIANNAKIS Introduction	1

Animal Passions. Chrysostom's Use of Animal Imagery.....

Gratitude: A Panacea for the Passions in John Chrysostom's Commentary on the *Psalms*.....

Justus T. GHORMLEY

185

Brian Dunkle John Chrysostom's Community of Anger Management	217
Andrew Crislip The Shepherd of Hermas and Early Christian Emotional Formation	231
Niki Kasumi CLEMENTS Emotions and Ascetic Formation in John Cassian's <i>Collationes</i>	241
Margaret Blume Freddoso The Value of Job's Grief in John Chrysostom's Commentary on Job: How John Blesses with Job's Tears	271
Jesse Siragan Arlen 'Let Us Mourn Continuously': John Chrysostom and the Early Christian Transformation of Mourning	289
Martin HINTERBERGER Basil of Caesarea and Gregory of Nazianzus Speaking about Anger and Envy: Some Remarks on the Fathers' Methodology of Treating Emotions and Modern Emotion Studies	313
Volume 10	
STUDIA PATRISTICA LXXXIV	
EVAGRIUS BETWEEN ORIGEN, THE CAPPADOCIANS, AND NEOPLATONISM	
(ed. Ilaria Ramelli, with the collaboration of Kevin Corrigan, Giulio Maspero and Monica Tobon)	
Ilaria RAMELLI Introduction	1
Samuel Fernández The Pedagogical Structure of Origen's <i>De principiis</i> and its Christology	15
Martin C. Wenzel The Omnipotence of God as a Challenge for Theology in Origen and Gregory of Nyssa	23

Table of Contents	13
Miguel Brugarolas Theological Remarks on Gregory of Nyssa's Christological Language of 'Mixture'	39
Ilaria Vigorelli Soul's Dance in Clement, Plotinus and Gregory of Nyssa	59
Giulio Maspero Isoangelia in Gregory of Nyssa and Origen on the Background of Plotinus	77
Ilaria RAMELLI Response to the Workshop, "Theology and Philosophy between Origen and Gregory of Nyssa"	101
Mark J. EDWARDS Dunamis and the Christian Trinity in the Fourth Century	105
Kevin Corrigan Trauma before Trauma: Recognizing, Healing and Transforming the Wounds of Soul-Mind in the Works of Evagrius of Pontus	123
Monica Tobon The Place of God: Stability and Apophasis in Evagrius	137
Theo Kobusch Practical Knowledge in 'Christian Philosophy': A New Way to God	157
Ilaria RAMELLI Gregory Nyssen's and Evagrius' Biographical and Theological Relations: Origen's Heritage and Neoplatonism	165
Volume 11	
STUDIA PATRISTICA LXXXV	
AMBROSE OF MILAN	
Isabella D'Auria Polemiche antipagane: Ambrogio (<i>epist.</i> 10, 73, 8) e Prudenzio (<i>c. Symm.</i> 2, 773-909) contro Simmaco (<i>rel.</i> 3, 10)	1

Victoria ZIMMERL-PANAGL	
Videtur nobis in sermone revivescere Preparing a New Critical Edition of Ambrose's Orationes funebres	15
Andrew M. Selby Ambrose's 'Inspired' Moderation of Tertullian's Christian Discipline	23
Sarah EMANUEL Virgin Heroes and Cross-Dressing Kings: Reading Ambrose's On Virgins 2.4 as Carnivalesque	41
Francesco Lubian Ambrose's <i>Disticha</i> and John 'Reclining on Christ's Breast' (Ambr., <i>Tituli</i> II [21], 1)	51
D.H. WILLIAMS Ambrose as an Apologist	65
Brendan A. HARRIS 'Where the Sanctification is One, the Nature is One': Pro-Nicene Pneumatology in Ambrose of Milan's Baptismal Theology	77
David VOPŘADA Bonum mihi quod humiliasti me. Ambrose's Theology of Humility and Humiliation	87
Paola Francesca Moretti 'Competing' exempla in Ambrose's De officiis	95
Metha Hokke Scent as Metaphor for the Bonding of Christ and the Virgin in Ambrose's <i>De virginitate</i> 11.60-12.68	107
J. WARREN SMITH Transcending Resentment: Ambrose, David, and Magnanimitas	121
Andrew M. HARMON Aspects of Moral Perfection in Ambrose's <i>De officiis</i>	133
Han-luen KANTZER KOMLINE From Building Blocks to Blueprints: Augustine's Reception of Ambrose's Commentary on Luke	153

Hedwig SCHMALZGRUBER Biblical Epic as Scriptural Exegesis – Reception of Ambrose in the So-called <i>Heptateuch</i> Poet	167
Carmen Angela CVETKOVIĆ Episcopal Literary Networks in the Late Antique West: Niceta of Remesiana and Ambrose of Milan	177
Stephen COOPER Ambrose in Reformation Zürich: Heinrich Bullinger's Use of Ambrosiaster's Commentaries on Paul	185
Volume 12	
STUDIA PATRISTICA LXXXVI	
AUGUSTINE ON CONSCIENTIA (ed. Diana Stanciu)	
Diana Stanciu Introduction	1
Allan Fitzgerald Augustine, Conscience and the Inner Teacher	3
Enrique A. EGUIARTE Conscientia () itineribus () in saptientiam	13
Matthew W. Knotts With Apologies to Jiminy Cricket. The Early Augustine's 'Sapiential' Account of conscientia	21
Anne-Isabelle Bouton-Touboulic Conscientiae requies (Conf. X, 30, 41): Sleep, Consciousness and Conscience in Augustine	37
Andrea Bizzozero Beati mundi cordes (Mt 5:8). Coscienza, Conoscenza e Uisio Dei in Agostino prima del 411	55
Josef Lössl How 'Bad' is Augustine's 'Bad Conscience' (mala conscientia)?	89

Marianne DJUTH The Polemics of Moral Conscience in Augustine	97
Diana Stanciu Conscientia, capax Dei and Salvation in Augustine: What Would Augustine Say on the 'Explanatory Gap'?	111
Jeremy W. Bergstrom Augustine on the Judgment of Conscience and the Glory of Man	119
Mark CLAVIER A Persuasive God: Conscience and the Rhetoric of Delight in Augustine's Interpretation of <i>Romans</i> 7	135
John Comstock The Augustinian Conscientia: A New Approach	141
Jérôme Lagouanère Augustin, lecteur de Sénèque: le cas de la <i>bona uoluntas</i>	153
Gábor Kendeffy Will and Moral Responsibility in Augustine's Works on Lying	163
Volume 13	
STUDIA PATRISTICA LXXXVII	
AUGUSTINE IN LATE MEDIEVAL PHILOSOPHY AND THEOLOGY	
(ed. John T. Slotemaker and Jeffrey C. Witt)	
David C. Fink & John T. Slotemaker In Memoriam David C. Steinmetz	1
John T. Slotemaker & Jeffrey C. Witt Introduction	3
John T. SLOTEMAKER The Reception of Augustine's Thought in the Later Middle Ages: A Historiographical Introduction	5
Peter Eardley Augustinian Science or Aristotelian Rhetoric? The Nature of Theology According to Giles of Rome	23

Bernd GOEHRING Giles of Rome on Human Cognition: Aristotelian and Augustinian Principles	35
Christopher M. WOJTULEWICZ The Reception of Augustine in the Theology of Alexander de Sancto Elpidio	47
Graham McAleer 1277 and the Sensations of the Damned: Peter John Olivi and the Augustinian Origins of Early Modern Angelism	59
Florian WÖLLER The Bible as Argument: Augustine in the Literal Exegesis of Peter Auriol (c. 1280-1322) and Nicholas of Lyra (c. 1270-1349)	67
Severin V. KITANOV Richard FitzRalph on Whether Cognition and Volition are Really the Same: Solving an Augustinian Puzzle	81
Simon Nolan Augustine in Richard FitzRalph (c. 1300-1360)	95
Jack HARDING BELL Loving Justice: Cicero, Augustine, and the Nature of Politics in Robert Holcot's Wisdom of Solomon Commentary	109
John T. SLOTEMAKER Peter Lombard's Inheritance: The Use of Augustine's <i>De Trinitate</i> in Gregory of Rimini's Discussion of the Divine Processions	123
John W. Peck Gregory of Rimini's Augustinian Defense of a World <i>ab aeterno</i>	135
Jeffrey C. Witt Tradition, Authority, and the Grounds for Belief in Late Fourteenth- Century Theology	147
Pekka KÄRKKÄINEN Augustinian, Humanist or What? Martin Luther's Marginal Notes on Augustine	161
David C. Fink Bullshitting Augustine: Patristic Rhetoric and Theological Dialectic in Philipp Melanchthon's <i>Analogia</i> for the Augsburg Confession	167

Ueli Zahnd The Early John Calvin and Augustine: Some Reconsiderations	181
Volume 14	
STUDIA PATRISTICA LXXXVIII	
LATREIA AND IDOLATRY: AUGUSTINE AND THE QUEST FOR RIGHT RELATIONSHIP (ed. Paul Camacho and Veronica Roberts)	
Veronica Roberts & Paul Camacho Introduction	1
Michael T. CAMACHO 'Having nothing yet possessing all things': Worship as the Sacrifice of Being not our Own	3
Erik J. VAN VERSENDAAL The Symbolism of Love: Use as Praise in St. Augustine's Doctrine of Creation	21
Paul Camacho Ours and Not Ours: Private and Common Goods in Augustine's Anthropology of Desire	35
Christopher M. Seiler Non sibi arroget minister plus quam quod ut minister (S. 266.3): St. Augustine's Imperative for Ministerial Humility	49
Robert McFadden Becoming Friends with Oneself: Cicero in the Cassiciacum Dialogues	57
Veronica ROBERTS Idolatry as the Source of Injustice in Augustine's <i>De ciuitate Dei</i>	69
Peter Busch Augustine's Limited Dialogue with the Philosophers in <i>De ciuitate</i> Dei 19	79
Joshua Nunziato Negotiating a Good Return? St. Augustine on the Economics of Secular Sacrifice	87

Volume 15 STUDIA PATRISTICA LXXXIX

THE FOUNTAIN AND THE FLOOD: MAXIMUS THE CONFESSOR AND PHILOSOPHICAL ENQUIRY

(ed. Sotiris Mitralexis)

Sotiris MITRALEXIS Introduction	1
Dionysios Skliris The Ontological Implications of Maximus the Confessor's Eschatology	3
Nicholas Loudovikos Consubstantiality beyond Perichoresis: Personal Threeness, Intra-divine Relations, and Personal Consubstantiality in Augustine's, Thomas Aquinas' and Maximus the Confessor's Trinitarian Theologies	33
Torstein Theodor TOLLEFSEN Whole and Part in the Philosophy of St Maximus the Confessor	47
Sebastian MATEIESCU Counting Natures and Hypostases: St Maximus the Confessor on the Role of Number in Christology	63
David Bradshaw St. Maximus on Time, Eternity, and Divine Knowledge	79
Sotiris MITRALEXIS A Coherent Maximian Spatiotemporality: Attempting a Close Reading of Sections Thirty-six to Thirty-nine from the Tenth <i>Ambiguum</i>	95
Vladimir CVETKOVIĆ The Concept of Delimitation of Creatures in Maximus the Confessor	117
Demetrios HARPER The Ontological Ethics of St. Maximus the Confessor and the Concept of Shame	129
Smilen Markov Maximus' Concept of Human Will through the Interpretation of Johannes Damascenus and Photius of Constantinople	143

John Panteleimon Manoussakis St. Augustine and St. Maximus the Confessor between the Beginning and the End.	155
and the End.	133
Volume 16	
STUDIA PATRISTICA XC	
CHRIST AS ONTOLOGICAL PARADIGM IN EARLY BYZANTINE THOUGHT	
(ed. Marcin Podbielski)	
Anna Zhyrkova Introduction	1
Sergey Trostyanskiy The Compresence of Opposites in Christ in St. Cyril of Alexandria's Oikonomia	3
Anna ZHYRKOVA From Christ to Human Individual: Christ as Ontological Paradigm in Early Byzantine Thought	25
Grzegorz Kotłowski A Philological Contribution to the Question of Dating Leontius of Jerusalem	49
Marcin Podbielski A Picture in Need of a Theory: Hypostasis in Maximus the Confessor's <i>Ambigua ad Thomam</i>	57
Volume 17	
STUDIA PATRISTICA XCI	
BIBLICA	
Camille Lepeigneux L'éphod de David dansant devant l'arche (2S. 6:14): problèmes textuels et exégèse patristique	3
Stephen WAERS Isaiah 44-5 and Competing Conceptions of Monotheism in the 2nd and 3rd Centuries	11

Simon C. MIMOUNI Jésus de Nazareth et sa famille ont-ils appartenus à la tribu des prêtres ? Quelques remarques et réflexions pour une recherche nouvelle	19
Joseph Verheyden The So-Called <i>Catena in Marcum</i> of Victor of Antioch: Throwing Light on <i>Mark</i> with a Not-So-Little Help from <i>Matthew</i> and <i>Luke</i>	47
Miriam DeCock The Good Shepherd of <i>John</i> 10: A Case Study of New Testament Exegesis in the Schools of Alexandria and Antioch	63
H.A.G. HOUGHTON The Layout of Early Latin Commentaries on the Pauline Epistles and their Oldest Manuscripts	71
David M. Reis Mapping Exilic Imaginaries: Greco-Roman Discourses of Displacement and the Book of <i>Revelation</i>	113
Stephan WITETSCHEK Polycrates of Ephesus and the 'Canonical John'	127
Gregory Allen ROBBINS 'Many a Gaud and a Glittering Toy' (Sayers): Fourth-Century Gospel Books	135
PHILOSOPHICA, THEOLOGICA, ETHICA	
Frances Young Riddles and Puzzles: God's Indirect Word in Patristic Hermeneutics.	149
Methody Zinkovskiy Hypostatic Characteristics of Notions of Thought, Knowledge and Cognition in the Greek Patristic Thought	157
Elena Ene D-VASILESCU Early Christianity about the Notions of Time and the Redemption of the Soul	167
Jack Bates Theosis <i>Kata To Ephikton</i> : The History of a Pious Hedge-Phrase	183

James K. LEE The Church and the Holy Spirit: Ecclesiology and Pneumatology in Tertullian, Cyprian, and Augustine	189
Maria LISSEK In Search of the Roots. Reference to Patristic Christology in Gilbert Crispin's Disputation with a Jew	207
Pak-Wah LAI Comparing Patristic and Chinese Medical Anthropologies: Insights for Chinese Contextual Theology	213
HAGIOGRAPHICA	
Katherine MILCO Ad Prodendam Virtutis Memoriam: Encomiastic Prefaces in Tacitus' Agricola and Latin Christian Hagiography	227
Megan DeVore Catechumeni, Not 'New Converts': Revisiting the Passio Perpetuae et Felicitatis	237
Christoph BIRKNER Hagiography and Autobiography in Cyril of Scythopolis	249
Flavia Ruani Preliminary Notes on Edifying Stories in Syriac Hagiographical Collections	257
Nathan D. Howard Sacred Spectacle in the Biographies of Gorgonia and Macrina	267
Marta Szada The Life of Balthild and the Rise of Aristocratic Sanctity	275
Robert Wiśniewski Eastern, Western and Local Habits in the Early Cult of Relics	283
ASCETICA	
Maria Giulia GENGHINI 'Go, sit in your cell, and your cell will teach you everything' (AP Moses 6): How the Physical Environment Shaped the Spirituality of Early Egyptian Monasticism	299

Rodrigo ÁLVAREZ GUTIÉRREZ El concepto de <i>xénitéia</i> en la hagiografía Monástica primitiva	313
Sean Moberg Examination of Conscience in the <i>Apophthegmata Patrum</i>	325
Daniel Lemeni The Fascination of the Desert: Aspects of Spiritual Guidance in the Apophthegmata Patrum	333
Janet TIMBIE 'Pay for Our Sins': A Shared Theme in the Pachomian Koinonia and the White Monastery Federation	347
Paula Tutty The Political and Philanthropic Role of Monastic Figures and Monasteries as Revealed in Fourth-Century Coptic and Greek Correspondence	353
Marianne SÁGHY Monica, the Ascetic	363
Gáspár PARLAGI The Letter <i>Ad filios Dei</i> of Saint Macarius the Egyptian – Questions and Hypotheses	377
Becky LITTLECHILDS Notes on Ascetic 'Regression' in Asterius' <i>Liber ad Renatum Mona-chum</i>	385
Laura Soureli The 'Prayer of the Heart' in the <i>Philokalia</i> : Questions and Caveats	391
Brouria Bitton-Ashkelony Monastic Hybridity and Anti-Exegetical Discourse: From Philoxenus of Mabbug to Dadišo Qatraya	417
Volume 18	
STUDIA PATRISTICA XCII	
LITURGICA AND TRACTATUS SYMBOLI	
Liuwe H. Westra Creating a Theological Difference: The Myth of Two Grammatical Constructions with Latin <i>Credo</i>	3

Tarmo Toom <i>Tractatus symboli</i> : A Brief Pre-Baptismal Explanation of the Creed	15
Joseph G. Mueller The Trinitarian Doctrine of the <i>Apostolic Constitutions</i>	25
Gregory Tucker 'O Day of Resurrection!': The Paschal Mystery in Hymns	41
Maria Munkholt Christensen Witnessed by Angels: The Role of Angels in Relation to Prayer in Four Ante-Nicene Euchological Treatises	49
Barry M. CRAIG He Lifted to You? Lost and Gained in Translation	57
Anna Adams Petrin Reconsidering the 'Egyptian Connection' in the Anaphora of Fourth-Century Jerusalem	65
Anthony Gelston The Post-Sanctus in the East Syrian Anaphoras	77
Graham Field Breaking Boundaries: The Cosmic Dimension of Worship	83
George A. Bevan The Sequence of the First Four Sessions of the Council of Chalcedon	91
ORIENTALIA	
Todd E. French Just Deserts: Origen's Lingering Influence on Divine Justice in the Hagiographies of John of Ephesus	105
Benedict M. GUEVIN Dialogue between Death and the Devil in Saint Ephrem the Syrian and Saint Romanos the Melodist	113
Paul M. PASQUESI <i>Qnoma</i> in Narsai: Anticipating <i>Energeia</i>	119

David G.K. TAYLOR Rufinus the Silver Merchant's Miaphysite Refutation of Leontius of Byzantium's <i>Epaporemata</i> (CPG 6814): A Rediscovered Syriac Text	127
Valentina Duca Pride in the Thought of Isaac of Nineveh	137
Valentin VESA The Divine Vision in Isaac of Niniveh and the East Syriac Christology	149
Theresia Hainthaler Colossians 1:15 in the Christological Reflection of East Syrian Authors	165
Michael Penn, Nicholas R. Howe & Kaylynn Crawford Automated Syriac Script Charts	175
Stephen J. Davis Cataloguing the Coptic and Arabic Manuscripts in the Monastery of the Syrians: A Preliminary Report	179
Damien Labadie A Newly Attributed Coptic <i>Encomium</i> on Saint Stephen (BHO 1093)	187
Anahit Avagyan Die armenische Übersetzung der pseudo-athanasianischen Homilie De passione et cruce domini (CPG 2247)	195
CRITICA ET PHILOLOGICA	
B.N. Wolfe The Gothic Palimpsest of Bologna	205
Meredith Danezan Proverbe (paroimia) et cursus spirituel : l'apport de l'Épitomé de la Chaîne de Procope	209
Aaron Pelttari Lector inueniet: A Commonplace of Late Antiquity	215
Peter Van Nuffelen The Poetics of Christian History in Late Antiquity	227

Yuliya MINETS Languages of Christianity in Late Antiquity: Between Universalism and Cultural Superiority	247
Peter F. Schadler Reading the Self by Reading the Other: A Hermeneutical Key to the Reading of Sacred Texts in Late Antiquity and Byzantium	261
HISTORICA	
Peter Gemeinhardt Teaching Religion in Late Antiquity: Divine and Human Agency	271
David Woods Constantine, Aurelian, and Aphaca	279
Luise Marion Frenkel Procedural Similarities between Fourth- and Fifth-Century Christian Synods and the Roman Senates: Myth, Politics or Cultural Identity?	293
Maria Konstantinidou Travelling and Trading in the Greek Fathers: Faraway Lands, Peoples and Products	303
Theodore DE BRUYN Historians, Bishops, Amulets, Scribes, and Rites: Interpreting a Christian Practice	317
Catherine C. TAYLOR Educated Susanna: Female <i>Orans</i> , Sarcophagi, and the Typology of Woman Wisdom in Late Antique Art and Iconography	339
David L. RIGGS Contesting the Legacy and Patronage of Saint Cyprian in Vandal Carthage	357
Jordina Sales-Carbonell The Fathers of the Church and their Role in Promoting Christian Constructions in <i>Hispania</i>	371
Bethany V. WILLIAMS The Significance of the Senses: An Exploration into the Multi-Sensory Experience of Faith for the Lay Population of Christianity during the Fourth and Fifth Centuries C.E.	381

Jacob A. Latham Adventus, Occursus, and the Christianization of Rome	397
Teodor Tăbuș The Orthodoxy of Emperor Justinian's Christian Faith as a Matter of Roman Law (<i>CJ</i> I,1,5-8)	411
Nicholas Mataya Charity Before Division: The Strange Case of Severinus of Noricum and the Pseudo-Evangelisation of the Rugians	423
Christian HORNUNG Die Konstruktion christlicher Identität. Funktion und Bedeutung der Apostasie im antiken Christentum (46. Jahrhundert n. Chr.)	431
Ronald A.N. KYDD Growing Evidence of Christianity's Establishment in China in the Late-Patristic Era	441
Luis Salés 'Aristotelian' as a <i>Lingua Franca</i> : Rationality in Christian Self-Representation under the 'Abbasids	453
Volume 19	
STUDIA PATRISTICA XCIII	
THE FIRST TWO CENTURIES	
Joshua Kinlaw Exegesis and <i>Homonoia</i> in <i>First Clement</i>	3
Janelle Peters The Phoenix in 1 <i>Clement</i>	17
Jonathan E. Soyars Clement of Rome's Reconstruction of Job's Character for Corinth: A Contextual Reading of the Composite Quotation of LXX <i>Job</i> 1-2 in 1 <i>Clem</i> . 17.3	27
Ingo SCHAAF The Earliest Sibylline Attestations in the Patristic Reception: Erudition and Religion in the 2 nd Century AD	35

J. Christopher Edwards Identifying the Lord in the <i>Epistle of Barnabas</i>	51
Donna Rizk The Apology of Aristides: the Armenian Version	61
Paul R. GILLIAM III Ignatius of Antioch: The Road to Chalcedon?	69
Alexander B. MILLER Polemic and Credal Refinement in Ignatius of Antioch	81
Shaily Shashikant Patel The 'Starhymn' of Ignatius' <i>Epistle to the Ephesians</i> : Re-Appropriation as Polemic	93
Paul Hartog The Good News in Old Texts? The 'Gospel' and the 'Archives' in Ign. Phld. 8.2	105
Stuart R. Thomson The Philosopher's Journey: Philosophical and Christian Conversions in the Second Century	123
Andrew HAYES The Significance of Samaritanism for Justin Martyr	141
Micah M. MILLER What's in a Name?: Titles of Christ in Justin Martyr	155
M ADRYAEL TONG Reading Gender in Justin Martyr: New Insights from Old Apologies	165
Pavel Dudzik Tatian the Assyrian and Greek Rhetoric: Homer's Heroes Agamemnon, Nestor and Thersites in Tatian's <i>Oratio ad Graecos</i>	179
Stuart E. Parsons Trading Places: Faithful Job and Doubtful Autolycus in Theophilus' Apology	191
László Perendy Theophilus' Silence about Aristotle. A Clandestine Approval of his View on the Mortality of the Soul?	199

Roland M. Sokolowski 'Zealous for the Covenant of Christ': An Inquiry into the Lost Career of Irenaeus of Lyons	213
Eric COVINGTON Irenaeus, <i>Ephesians</i> , and Union with the Spirit: Examining the Scriptural Basis of Unity with the Spirit in <i>AH</i> V 20.2	219
Sverre Elgvin Lied Irenaeus of Lyons and the Eucharistic Altar in Heaven	229
John Kaufman The Kingdom of the Son in the Theology of Irenaeus	237
Thomas D. McGlothlin Why Are All These Damned People Rising? Paul and the Generality of the Resurrection in Irenaeus and Tertullian	243
Scott D. Moringiello Allegory and Typology in Irenaeus of Lyon	255
Francesca MINONNE Aulus Gellius and Irenaeus of Lyons in the Cultural Context of the Second Century AD	265
Eugen Maftei Irénée de Lyon et Athanase d'Alexandrie: ressemblances et différences entre leurs sotériologies	275
István M. Bugár Melito and the Body	303
APOCRYPHA AND GNOSTICA	
Pamela Mullins Reaves Gnosis in Alexandria: A Study in Ancient Christian Interpretation and Intra-Group Dynamics	315
Csaba Ötvös Creation and Epiphany? Theological Symbolism in the Creation Narrative of <i>On the Origin of the World</i> (NHC II 5)	325

Hugo Lundhaug The Dialogue of the Savior (NHC III,5) as a Monastic Text	335
Kristine Toft Rosland Fatherhood and the Lack thereof in the <i>Apocryphon of John</i>	347
Jeremy W. Barrier Abraham's Seed: Tracing <i>Pneuma</i> as a Material Substance from Paul's Writings to the <i>Apocryphon of John</i>	357
Volume 20	
STUDIA PATRISTICA XCIV	
FROM TERTULLIAN TO TYCONIUS	
Anni Maria Laato Tertullian, <i>Adversus Iudaeos</i> Literature, and the 'Killing of the Prophets'-Argument	1
Ian L.S. Balfour Tertullian and Roman Law – What Do We (Not) Know?	11
Benjamin D. HAUPT Tertullian's Text of <i>Galatians</i>	23
Stéphanie E. BINDER Tertullien face à la romanisation de l'Afrique du Nord : une discussion de quelques aspects	29
Christopher T. BOUNDS The Doctrine of Christian Perfection in Tertullian	45
Kathryn Thostenson Serving Two Masters: Tertullian on Marital and Christian Duties	55
Edwina Murphy Widows, Welfare and the Wayward: 1 <i>Timothy</i> 5 in Cyprian's <i>Ad Quirinum</i>	67
Charles BOBERTZ Almsgiving as Patronage: The Role of the Patroness in Third Century North African Christianity	75

Daniel BECERRA Origen, the Stoics, and the Rhetoric of Recitation: Spiritual Exercise and the <i>Exhortation to Martyrdom</i>	85
Antti Laato A Cold Case Reopened: A Jewish Source on Christianity Used by Celsus and the <i>Toledot Yeshu</i> Literature – From Counter-Exegetical Arguments to Full-Blown Counter-Story	99
Eric Scherbenske Origen, Manuscript Variation, and a Lacking Gospel Harmony	111
Jennifer Otto Origen's Criticism of Philo of Alexandria	121
Riemer ROUKEMA The Retrieval of Origen's Commentary on Micah	131
Giovanni Hermanin de Reichenfeld Resurrection and Prophecy: The Spirit in Origen's Exegesis of Lazarus and Caiaphas in <i>John</i> 11	143
Elizabeth Ann Dively Lauro The Meaning and Significance of Scripture's Sacramental Nature within Origen's Thought	153
David Neal Greenwood Celsus, Origen, and the Eucharist	187
Vito LIMONE Origen on the Song of Songs. A Reassessment and Proposal of Dating of his Writings on the Song	195
Allan E. Johnson The Causes of Things: Origen's Treatises <i>On Prayer</i> and <i>On First Principles</i> and His Exegetical Method	205
Brian Barrett 'Of His Fullness We Have All Received': Origen on Scripture's Unity	211
Mark Randall James Anatomist of the Prophetic Words: Origen on Scientific and Hermeneutic Method	219

Joseph Lenow Patience and Judgment in the Christology of Cyprian of Carthage	233
Mattias GASSMAN The Conversion of Cyprian's Rhetoric? Towards a New Reading of Ad Donatum	247
Laetitia Ciccolini Le texte de 1 <i>Cor</i> . 7:34 chez Cyprien de Carthage	259
Dawn LaValle Feasting at the End: The Eschatological <i>Symposia</i> of Methodius of Olympus and Julian the Apostate	269
Marie-Noëlle VIGNAL Méthode d'Olympe, lecteur et exégète de Saint Paul	285
Johannes Breuer The Rhetoric of Persuasion as Hermeneutical Key to Arnobius' Adversus nationes	295
Volume 21 STUDIA PATRISTICA XCV	
THE FOURTH CENTURY	
Elizabeth DePalma Digeser Pseudo-Justin's <i>Cohortatio ad Graecos</i> and the Great Persecution	3
Atsuko GOTOH The 'Conversion' of Constantine the Great: His Religious Legislation in the Theodosian Code	13
Vladimir Latinovic Arius Conservativus? The Question of Arius' Theological Belonging	27
Sébastien MORLET Eusèbe le grammairien. Note sur les <i>Questions évangéliques</i> (À Marinos, 2) et une scholie sur Pindare	43
Thomas O'LOUGHLIN Some Hermeneutical Assumptions Latent within the Gospel Apparatus of Eusebius of Caesarea	51

Michael Bland SIMMONS Exegesis and Hermeneutics in Eusebius of Caesarea's <i>Theophany</i>	
(Book IV): The Contemporary Fulfillment of Jesus' Prophecies	65
Sophie CARTWRIGHT Should we Crieve and Do Afraid? Christ's Dessions versus the Dos	
Should we Grieve and Be Afraid? Christ's Passions versus the Passions of the Soul in Athanasius of Alexandria	77
William G. Rusch	0.5
Athanasius of Alexandria and 'Sola Scriptura'	87
Lois M. FARAG	
Organon in Athanasius' De incarnatione: A Case of Textual Interpolation	93
Donna R. Hawk-Reinhard	
The Role of the Holy Spirit in Cyril of Jerusalem's Sacramental Theology	107
Olga Lorgeoux	110
Choice and Will in the Catecheses of Cyril of Jerusalem	119
Florian ZACHER Marius Victorinus, <i>Opus ad Candidum</i> . An Analysis of its Rhetorical Structure	127
CAPPADOCIAN WRITERS	
Claudio Moreschini	
Is it Possible to Speak of 'Cappadocian Theology' as a System?	139
Nienke M. Vos	
'Teach us to pray': Self-Understanding in Macrina's Final Prayer	165
Adam Rasmussen	
Defending Moses. Understanding Basil's Apparent Rejection of Allegory in the <i>Hexaemeron</i>	175
Marco Quircio	
A Philological Note to Basil of Caesarea's Second Homily on the Hexaemeron	183

Mattia C. CHIRIATTI	
ἀγών/θέα-θέαμα and στάδιον/θέατρον: A Reviewed ἔκφρασις of the Spectacle in Basil's <i>In Gordium martyrem</i>	189
Arnaud Perrot Une source littéraire de l' <i>Ep</i> . 46 de Basile de Césarée : le traité <i>De la véritable intégrité dans la virginité</i>	201
Aude Busine Basil of Caesarea and the <i>Praise of the City</i>	209
Benoît GAIN Le voyage de Basile de Césarée en Orient : hypothèses sur le silence des sources externes	217
Seumas MACDONALD Contested Ground: Basil's Use of Scripture in <i>Against Eunomius</i> 2	225
Nikolai LIPATOV-CHICHERIN An Unpublished Funerary Speech (CPG 2936) and the Question of Succession to St. Basil the Great	237
Kimberly F. Baker Basil and Augustine: Preaching on Care for the Poor	251
Oliver Langworthy Sojourning and the Sojourner in Gregory of Nazianzus	261
Alexander D. Perkins The Grave Politics of Gregory Nazianzen's Eulogy for Gorgonia	269
Gabrielle THOMAS Divine, Yet Vulnerable: The Paradoxical Existence of Gregory Nazianzen's <i>Imago Dei</i>	281
Bradley K. Storin Reconsidering Gregory of Nazianzus' Letter Collection	291
Andrew RADDE-GALLWITZ Gregory on Gregory: Catechetical Oration 38	303
Andrew J. Summerson Gregory Nazianzus' Mixture Language in Maximus the Confessor's <i>Ambigua</i> : What the Confessor Learned from the Theologian	315

*Eκφρασις and Epistemology in Gregory of Nazianzus	321
Karen CARDUCCI Implicit Stipulations in the <i>Testamentum</i> of Gregory of Nazianzos <i>vis-à-vis</i> the <i>Testamenta</i> of Remigius of Rheims, Caesarius of Arles, and Aurelianus of Ravenna	331
Michael J. Petrin Eunomius and Gregory of Nyssa on τὸ τῆς εὐσεβείας μυστήριον	343
Andra Jugănaru The Function of Miracles in Gregory of Nyssa's Hagiographical Works	355
Makrina FINLAY Gregory of Nyssa's Framework for the Resurrected Life in <i>The Life</i> of St. Macrina	367
Marta Przyszychowska Three States after Death according to Gregory of Nyssa	377
Ann Conway-Jones An Ambiguous Type: The Figure of Aaron Interpreted by Gregory of Nyssa and Ephrem the Syrian	389
Robin Orton The Place of the Eucharist in Gregory of Nyssa's Soteriology	399
Anne Karahan Cyclic Shapes and Divine Activity. A Cappadocian Inquiry into Byzantine Aesthetics	405
Hilary Anne-Marie MOONEY Eschatological Themes in the Writings of Gregory of Nyssa and John Scottus Eriugena	421
Benjamin Ekman 'Natural Contemplation' in Evagrius Ponticus' Scholia on Proverbs	431
Margaret Guise The Golden and Saving Chain and its (De)construction: Soteriological Conversations between Jacques Derrida, Jean-Luc Marion and the Cappadocian Fathers	441

Volume 22 STUDIA PATRISTICA XCVI

THE SECOND HALF OF THE FOURTH CENTURY

Kelley Spoerl Epiphanius on Jesus' Digestion	3
Young Richard Kim Nicaea is Not Enough: The Second Creed of Epiphanius' <i>Ancoratus</i>	11
John Voelker Marius Victorinus' Use of a Gnostic Commentary	21
Tomasz Stępień Action of Will and Generation of the Son in Extant Works of Eunomius	29
Alberto J. QUIROGA PUERTAS 'In the Gardens of Adonis'. Religious Disputations in Julian's <i>Caesars</i>	37
Ariane Magny Porphyry and Julian on Christians	47
Jeannette Kreijkes The Impact of Theological Concepts on Calvin's Reception of Chrysostom's Exegesis of <i>Galatians</i> 4:21-6	57
Hellen DAYTON John Chrysostom on <i>katanuxis</i> as the Source of Spiritual Healing	65
Michaela Durst The Epistle to the Hebrews in the 7 th Oration of John Chrysostom's Orationes Adversus Judaeos	71
Paschalis GKORTSILAS The Lives of Others: Pagan and Christian Role Models in John Chrysostom's Thought	83
Malouine DE DIEULEVEULT L'exégèse de la faute de David (2 <i>Règnes</i> 11-12): Jean Chrysostome et Théodoret de Cyr	95

Matteo CARUSO Hagiographic Style of the <i>Vita Spyridonis</i> between Rhetoric and Exegetical Tradition: Analogies between John Chrysostom's Homilies and the Work of Theodore of Paphos	103
Paul C. Boles Method and Meaning in Chrysostom's <i>Homily 7</i> and Origen's <i>Homily 1</i> on <i>Genesis</i>	111
Susan B. Griffith Apostolic Authority and the 'Incident at Antioch': Chrysostom on <i>Gal.</i> 2:11-4	117
James D. COOK Therapeutic Preaching: The Use of Medical Imagery in the Sermons of John Chrysostom	127
Demetrios Bathrellos Sola gratia? Sola fide? Law, Grace, Faith, and Works in John Chrysostom's Commentary on Romans	133
Marie-Eve Geiger Les homélies de Jean Chrysostome <i>In principium Actorum</i> : le titre pris comme principe exégétique	147
Pierre Augustin Quelques sources Parisiennes du <i>Chrysostome</i> de Sir Henry Savile.	157
Thomas Brauch The Emperor Theodosius I and the Nicene Faith: A Brief History	175
Sergey Kim Severian of Gabala as a Witness to Life at the Imperial Court in Fifth-Century Constantinople	189
FROM THE FIFTH CENTURY ONWARDS (GREEK WRITERS)	
Austin Dominic Litke The 'Organon Concept' in the Christology of Cyril of Alexandria	207
Barbara VILLANI Some Remarks on the Textual Tradition and the Literary Genre of Cyril of Alexandria's <i>De adoratione et cultu in spiritu et veritate</i>	215

All Cyrillians? Cyril of Alexandria as Norm of Orthodoxy at the Council of Chalcedon	225
Hans VAN LOON Virtue in Cyril of Alexandria's Festal Letters	237
George KALANTZIS Passibility, Tentability, and the Divine Οὐσία in the Debate between Cyril and Nestorius	249
James E. Goehring 'Talking Back' in Pachomian Hagiography: Theodore's Catechesis and the Letter of Ammon	257
James F. Wellington Let God Arise: The Divine Warrior <i>Motif</i> in Theodoret of Cyrrhus' Commentary on <i>Psalm</i> 67	265
Agnès LORRAIN Exégèse et argumentation scripturaire chez Théodoret de Cyr: 1'In Romanos, écho des controverses trinitaires et christologiques des IVe et Ve siècles	273
Kathryn KLEINKOPF A Landscape of Bodies: Exploring the Role of Ascetics in Theodoret's Historia Religiosa	283
Maya GOLDBERG New Syriac Edition and Translation of Theodore of Mopsuestia's Reconstructed Commentary on Paul's Minor Epistles: Fragments Collected from MS (olim) Diyarbakir 22	293
Georgiana Huian The Spiritual Experience in Diadochus of Photike	301
Eirini A. Artemi The Comparison of the Triadological Teaching of Isidore of Pelusium with Cyril of Alexandria's Teaching	309
Madalina Toca Isidore of Pelusium's Letters to Didymus the Blind	325

Michael Muthreich Ein äthiopisches Fragment der dem Dionysius Areopagita zuge- schriebenen Narratio de vita sua	333
István Perczel Theodoret of Cyrrhus: The Main Source of Pseudo-Dionysius' Christology?	351
Panagiotis G. Pavlos Aptitude (Ἐπιτηδειότης) and the Foundations of Participation in the Philosophy of Dionysius the Areopagite	377
Joost VAN ROSSUM The Relationship between Dionysius the Areopagite and Maximus the Confessor: Revisiting the Problem	397
Dimitrios A. VASILAKIS Dionysius <i>versus</i> Proclus on Undefiled Providence and its Byzantine Echoes in Nicholas of Methone	407
José María Nieva The Mystical Sense of the Aesthetic Experience in Dionysius the Areopagite	419
Ernesto Sergio Mainoldi Why Dionysius the Areopagite? The Invention of the First Father	425
Alexandru Prelipcean The Influence of Romanos the Melodist on the <i>Great Canon</i> of Saint Andrew of Crete: Some Remarks about Christological Typologies	441
Alexis TORRANCE 'Assuming our nature corrupted by sin': Revisiting Theodore the Studite on the Humanity of Christ	451
Scott Ables The Rhetoric of Persuasion in the Polemic of John of Damascus	457
James A. Francis Ancient Seeing/Christian Seeing: The Old and the New in John of Damascus	469
Zachary Keith The Problem of ἐνυπόστατον in John Damascene: Why Is Jesus Not a Human Person?	477

Nicholas Bamford Being, Christian Gnosis, and Deified Becoming in the 'Theoretikon'.	485
Alexandros Chouliaras The <i>Imago Trinitatis</i> in St Symeon the New Theologian and Niketas Stethatos: Is this the Basic Source of St Gregory Palamas' own Approach?	493
GREGORY PALAMAS' EPISTULA III	
(ed. Katharina Heyden)	
Katharina Heyden Introduction: The Two Versions of Palamas' <i>Epistula</i> III to Akindynos	507
Katharina HEYDEN The Two <i>Epistulae</i> III of Palamas to Akindynos: The Small but Important Difference between Authenticity and Originality	511
Theodoros Alexopoulos The Problem of the Distinction between Essence and Energies in the Hesychast Controversy. Saint Gregory Palamas' <i>Epistula</i> III: The Version Published by P. Chrestou in Light of Palamas' Other Works on the Divine Energies.	521
Renate Burri The Textual Transmission of Palamas' <i>Epistula</i> III to Akindynos: The Case of Monac. gr. 223	535
Dimitrios Moschos Reasons of Being versus Uncreated Energies – Neoplatonism and Mathematics as Means of Participating in God according to Nice- phorus Gregoras	547
Volume 23	
STUDIA PATRISTICA XCVII	
FROM THE FOURTH CENTURY ONWARDS (LATIN WRITERS)	
Anthony P. COLEMAN Comparing Institutes: Lactantius' Divinae Institutiones in Calvin's Institutio christianae religionis 1.1-5	3

Jessica VAN 'T WESTEINDE Jerome and the <i>Christianus Perfectus</i> , a Transformed Roman Noble Man?	17
Silvia Georgieva Domina, Filia, Conserva, Germana: The Identity of the Correspondent in Saint Jerome's Letters	37
Roberta Franchi <i>Muliercularum socii</i> (Hier., <i>Ep.</i> 133,4): donne ed eresia nell' <i>Epistolario</i> di Gerolamo	51
Richard SEAGRAVES Prudentius: Contra orationem Symmachi, Bk. I	63
Klazina Staat 'Let him thus be a Hippolytus' (<i>Perist</i> . 11.87): Horror and Rhetoric in Prudentius' <i>Peristephanon</i> 11	79
Diane Shane Fruchtman Witness and Imitation in the Writings of Paulinus of Nola	87
Lorenzo SCIAJNO Salvation behind the Web (Paul. Nol., <i>Carm.</i> XVI 93-148): Connections and Echoes of a Fairy-tale Theme in Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages between West and East	97
Ewa Dusik-Krupa Politician, Theologian, Tutor. Luciferi Calaritanis' Use of Holy Scripture	103
Vincenzo Messana Massimino ariano e la Sicilia: il dibattito storiografico negli ultimi decenni su una <i>vexata quaestio</i>	115
Salvatore Costanza Il variegato panorama di accezioni dei termini <i>Romanus</i> e <i>barbarus</i> , Christianus e paganus negli scritti di Salviano	129
Matthew J. Pereira The Intertextual Tradition of Prosper's De vocatione omnium gentium	143

Raúl VILLEGAS MARÍN Abjuring Manichaeism in Ostrogothic Rome and Provence: The Commonitorium quomodo sit agendum cum Manichaeis and the Prosperi anathematismi	159
Mantė Lenkaitytė Ostermann John Cassian Read by Eucherius of Lyon: Affinities and Divergences	169
Daniel G. OPPERWALL Obedience and Communal Authority in John Cassian	183
Gerben F. Wartena Epic Emotions: Narratorial Involvement in Sedulius' Carmen Paschale	193
Tim Denecker Evaluations of Multilingual Competence in Cassiodorus' <i>Variae</i> and <i>Institutiones</i>	203
Hector SCERRI On Menstruation, Marital Intercourse and 'Wet Dreams' in a Letter by Gregory the Great	211
Jerzy Szafranowski To See with Body and to See with Mind: Corporeal and Spiritual Cognition in the 'Dialogues' of Gregory the Great	219
Pere Maymó i Capdevila Chants, Icons, and Relics in the Evangelization Doctrine of Gregory the Great: The Case of Kent	225
Stephen Blackwood Scriptural Allusions and the Wholeness of Wisdom in Boethius' Consolation of Philosophy	237
Juan Antonio Jiménez Sánchez A Brief Catalogue of Superstitions in Chapter 16 of Martin of Braga's De correctione rusticorum	245
Alberto Ferreiro 'Sufficit septem diebus': Seven Days Mourning the Dead in the Letters of St. Braulio of Zaragoza	255

Susan Cremin Bede's Interpretative Practice in his Homilies on the Gospels	265
NACHLEBEN	
Bronwen NEIL Reception of Late-Antique Popes in the Medieval Byzantine Tradition	283
Ken Parry Providence, Resurrection, and Restoration in Byzantine Thought, Eighth to Ninth Centuries	295
Eiji HISAMATSU Spätbyzantinische Übernahme der Vorstellung von der Lichtvision des Euagrios Pontikos, erörtert am Beispiel des Gregorios Sinaites.	305
Catherine KAVANAGH Eriugena's Trinity: A Framework for Intercultural and Interreligious Dialogue	311
Tobias Georges The <i>Apophthegmata Patrum</i> in the Context of the Occidental Reformation of Monastic Life during the 11 th and 12 th Centuries. The Case of Peter Abelard	323
Christopher M. Wojtulewicz Augustine and the Dissolution of Polarity. Some Thoughts on Augustine Reception in the Late 13 th and Early 14 th Centuries According to Thomas Aquinas and Meister Eckhart	329
Marie-Anne Vannier Origen, a Source of Meister Eckhart's Thinking	345
Lavinia CERIONI The Patristic Sources of Eriugena's Exegesis of the Parable of the Bridesmaids	355
Thomas F. Heyne A Polemicist rather than a Patrologist: Calvin's Attitude to and Use of the Early Church Fathers	367

Volume 24 STUDIA PATRISTICA XCVIII

ST AUGUSTINE AND HIS OPPONENTS

Susanna ELM Sold to Sin Through <i>Origo</i> : Augustine of Hippo and the Late Roman Slave Trade	1
Michael J. THATE Augustine and the Economics of Libido	23
Willemien Otten The Fate of Augustine's <i>Genesis</i> Exegesis in Medieval Hexaemeral Commentaries: The Cases of John Scottus Eriugena and Robert Grosseteste	51
Midori E. HARTMAN Beginning Again, Becoming Animal: Augustine's Theology, Animality, and Physical Pain in <i>Genesis</i>	71
Sarah Stewart-Kroeker Groaning with the Psalms: The Cultivation of World-Weariness in Augustine's <i>Enarrationes in Psalmos</i>	81
Marie Pauliat Non inueni tantam fidem in Israel: la péricope de l'acte de foi du centurion (Matt. 8:5-13) interprétée dans les Sermones in Matthaeum d'Augustin d'Hippone	91
Joseph L. Grabau Christology and Exegesis in Augustine of Hippo's XV th Tractate In Iohannis Euangelium	103
Teppei Kato Greek or Hebrew? Augustine and Jerome on Biblical Translation	109
Rebekka Schirner Augustine's Theory of Signs – A Hermeneutical Key to his Practice of Dealing with Different Biblical Versions?	121
Erika KIDD The Drama of <i>De magistro</i>	133

Douglas Finn The Holy Spirit and the Church in the Earliest Augustine: An Analysis of the Character of Monnica in the Cassiciacum Dialogues	141
John Peter Kenney Nondum me esse: Augustine's Early Ontology	167
Maureen A. TILLEY Pseudo-Cyprian and the Rebaptism Controversy in Africa	173
Heather Barkman 'Stubborn and Insolent' or 'Enfeebled by Riches'? The Construction of Crispina's Identity	181
David E. WILHITE Were the 'Donatists' a National or Social Movement in Disguise? Reframing the Question	191
Naoki Kamimura The Relation of the Identity of North African Christians to the Spiritual Training in the Letters of Augustine	221
Edward Arthur Naumann The Damnation of Baptized Infants according to Augustine	239
Jane MERDINGER Defying Donatism Subtly: Augustine's and Aurelius' Liturgical Canons at the Council of Hippo	273
Marius Anton VAN WILLIGEN Did Augustine Change or Broaden his Perspective on Baptism?	287
Jesse A. HOOVER 'They Agreed with the Followers of Arius': The 'Arianization' of the Donatist Church in Late Antique Heresiology	295
Joshua M. Bruce The Necessities of Judgment: Augustine's Juridical Response to the Donatists	307
Carles BUENACASA PÉREZ Why Suicides Instead of Martyrs? Augustine and the Persecution of Donatists	315

Colten Cheuk-Yin YAM Augustine's Intention in Proceeding from 'mens, notitia, amor' to 'memoria, intellegentia, voluntas'	327
Robert Parks Augustine and Proba on the Renewed Union of Man and Woman in Christ's Humanity and the Church	341
Victor Yudin Augustine on Omnipotence versus Porphyry Based on Appropriation of Plato's <i>Timaeus</i> 41ab	353
Johanna RÁKOS-ZICHY The Resurrection Body in Augustine	373
Pierre Descotes Une demande d'intercession bien maladroite : la correspondance entre Augustin d'Hippone et Nectarius	385
Giulio Malavasi John of Jerusalem's Profession of Faith (CPG 3621) and the Pelagian Controversy	399
Katherine Chambers The Meaning of 'Good Works' in Augustine's Anti-Pelagian Writings	409
Kenneth M. WILSON Re-dating Augustine's <i>Ad Simplicianum</i> 1.2 to the Pelagian Controversy	431
Nozomu Yamada Pelagius' Narrative Techniques, their Rhetorical Influences and Negative Responses from Opponents Concerning the Acts of the Synod of Diospolis	451
Piotr M. PACIOREK The Controversy between Augustine and Julian of Eclanum: On Law and Grace	463
Timo Nisula 'This Three-Headed Hellhound' – Evil Desire as the Root (<i>radix</i>) of All Sins in Augustine's Sermons	483

Jonathan Martin CIRAULO Sacramental Hermeneutics: Augustine's <i>De doctrina Christiana</i> in the Berengarian Controversy	495
Elizabeth KLEIN The Silent Word: Speech in the Confessions	509
Christian COPPA The Creatureliness of Time and the Goodness of Narrative in Augustine's Confessions	517
D.L. DUSENBURY New Light on Time in Augustine's <i>Confessions</i>	529
Math Osseforth Augustine's Confessions: A Discourse Analysis	545
Sean Hannan Demonic Historiography and the Historical Sublime in Augustine's City of God	553
Jimmy Chan The Restoration Word Group in <i>De civitate Dei</i> , Books XI-XXII: A Study of an Important Backbone of Augustine's Theology of History	561
Michael L. Carreker Sapientia as Dialectic in Book XV of Augustine's De Trinitate	569
Augustine M. Reisenauer Wonder and Significance in Augustine's Theology of Miracles	577
Makiko Sato Confession of a Human Being as Darkness in Augustine	589
Rowena Pailing Does Death Sting? Some Thoughts from the Mature Augustine	599
Kitty BOUWMAN Wisdom Christology in the Works of St. Augustine	607
Mark G. VAILLANCOURT The Predestinarian Gottschalk of Orbais: Faithful Augustinian or Heretic?: The Ninth Century Carolingian Debate Revisited	621

Matthew Drever	
Speaking from the Depths: Augustine and Luther's Christological Reading of <i>Substantia</i> in <i>Psalm</i> 69	629
Cassandra M.M. CASIAS The Vulnerable Slave-Owner in Augustine's Sermons	641
Kyle Hurley Kenoticism in <i>The Brothers Karamazov</i> and <i>Confessions</i> : Descending to Ascend	653
Elizabeth A. CLARK Augustine and American Professors in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries: From Adulation to Critique	667
Shane M. OWENS Christoecclesial Participation: Augustine, Zizioulas, and Contemporary Ecumenism	675
Dongsun Cho The Eternal Relational Submission of the Son to the Father: A Critical Reading of a Contemporary Evangelical Trinitarian Controversy on Augustine	683